## E-crime

## CS642: Computer Security



## Professor Ristenpart

 http://www.cs.wisc.edu/~rist/ rist at cs dot wisc dot edu
## Researcher Finds Nearly Two Dozen SCADA Bugs In a Few Hours

Posted by samzenpus on Monday November 26, @05:10PM from the target-rich-environment dept.

Trailrunner7 writes
"It is open season on SCADA software right now. Last week, researchers at ReVuln, an Italian security firm, released a video showing off a number of zero-day vulnerabilities in SCADA applications from manufacturers such as Siemens, GE and Schneider Electric. And now a researcher at Exodus Intelligence says he has discovered more than 20 flaws in SCADA packages from some of the same vendors and other manufacturers, all after just a few hours' work."

## [Re]Vuln

## Spam, phishing, scams

- Spam
- unsolicited bulk emails
- 2006: 80\% of emails on web, 85 billion messages a day
- Scam spam
- Nigerian emails (advanced fee fraud / confidence trick)
- Phishing
- trick users into downloading malware, submitting CC info to attacker, etc.
- Spear phishing: targeted on individuals (used in highprofile intrusions)


## Spanish Prisoner confidence trick

- Late $19^{\text {th }}$ century
- In contact with rich guy in Spanish prison
- Just need a little money to bribe guards, he'll reward you greatly

CAN YOU REALLY TRUST ANYONE?

#  a DAVID MAMET FLIM 

```
from Mrs. Zarina Al-Usman <zarina_alusman@kimo.com>\
subject Re: My Desire for you Over Less Privileged Children
to undisclosed-recipients: , )
```

Hi Dear,
I am Mrs. Zarina Al-Usman, I have been diagnosed with Esophageal cancer. It has defied all forms of
medical treatment, and Right now, I have only about a few months to live and I want you to
Distribute my funds worth Twelve Million Five Hundred Thousand US Dollars to charities homes in your
country.
I have set aside 40\% for you and your family so keep this as a secret to yourself because this will
be my last wish.
Yours Truly,
Mrs. Zarina Al-Usman
WebMail FDV - MG
Faculdade Viçosa

```
    from Fatemeh Akhoundi <akhounf@student.ednet.ns.ca>N
subject Your mailbox has exceeded its limit
    to undisclosed-recipients:;%
OM/5unk Mail
Your mailbox has exceeded its limit. Your webmail is currently running
99.7% of its Quota limit of 100%. You cannot send or receive email until
you have updated your webmail account. To update your webmail account,
copy the link below and paste in your browser to request for upgrade.
http://upgradeportal11.media.officelive.com/default.aspx
We are sincerely sorry for any inconvenience this might cause you; we tend
to serve you better.
Thanks for your co-operation.
Webmail Update Team
```


## Spam

- The frontend (email recipients)
- Filtering, classification
- Psychology, usability
- The backend (email generation)
- Open email relays
- Botnets
- Social structure
- Affiliates
- Criminal organizations


## Botnets

- Botnets:
- Command and Control (C\&C)
- Zombie hosts (bots)
- C\&C type:
- centralized, peer-to-peer
- Infection vector:
- spam, random/targeted scanning
- Usage:
- What they do: spam, DDoS, SEO, traffic generation,


## How to make money off a botnet?

- Rental
- "Pay me money, and l'll let you use my botnet... no questions asked"
- DDoS extortion
- "Pay me or I take your legitimate business off web"
- Bulk traffic selling
- "Pay me to direct bots to websites to boost visit counts"
- Click fraud, SEO
- "Simulate clicks on advertised links to generate revenue"
- Cloaking, link farms, etc.
- Theft of monetizable data (eg., financial accounts)
- Data ransom
- "I've encrypted your harddrive, now pay me money to unencrypt it"
- Advertise products


## How to make money off financial credentials?

- Money mules
- Deposits into mules' account from the victim's
- Mule purchases items using stolen CCN, sells them online
- Mule withdraws cash from ATMs using victim credentials
- Wires money to (frequently) former Soviet Union

from Richard Hill [hill@hetajobs.com](mailto:hill@hetajobs.com)
subject Cool Student Job
to pubs@cs.wisc.edu


## Dear Student,

```
I would like to offer you a new interesting and respectable job!
```

We are looking for people to work as professional distance-based typists. No experience is needed!
If you're eager to use your skills to make some additional cash, then you might want to consider a home typing position!
All data entry operators work from home and are independent contractors.
You typically set your own hours and work from home on projects that are enjoyable!
Average monthly earnings start from $\$ 1000$ to $\$ 3000$ or more.
Requirements:
-Computer with Internet access.
-Good Typing Skills.
-Basic Internet knowledge.
-Basic Computer and Typing Skills.
You will not have to devote full time hours. These assignments can be done on your time.
They may be done in Internet cafes or where ever you can get Internet access!
If you are interested just reply to my email!
Best Regards,
Richard Hill
Local Recruitment Manager

## Underground forums

|  | Threads |  | Users |  | Top |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | :--- |
| Category | B | S | B | S | Subcategory |
| payments | 8,507 | 8,092 | 1,539 | 1,409 | paysafecard |
| game-related | 2,379 | 2,584 | 924 | 987 | steam |
| accounts | 2,119 | 2,067 | 850 | 974 | rapidshare |
| credit cards | 996 | 1160 | 467 | 566 | unspecified cc |
| software/keys | 729 | 1410 | 422 | 740 | key/serial |
| fraud tools | 652 | 1155 | 363 | 601 | socks |
| tutorials/guides | 950 | 537 | 562 | 393 | tutorials |
| mail/drop srvs | 751 | 681 | 407 | 364 | packstation |
| merchandise | 493 | 721 | 264 | 404 | ipod |
| services | 266 | 916 | 176 | 555 | carder |

Table 6: Top 10 most commonly traded merchandise categories on LC.

## Agobot (circa 2002)

- IRC botnet
- Rich feature set:
- Well-documented, modular codebase
- IRC-based C\&C system
- Large catalogue of remote exploits
- Limited code obfuscation and anti-disassembly techniques
- Built-in data collection
- Mechanisms to disable antivirus
- Large set of bot commands


## Storm botnet

- Sept 2007
- Media: 1-50 million bots


Figure 1: The Storm botnet hierarchy.

## Features:

- Uses P2P (Overnet/Kademlia)
- Uses fast-flux DNS for hosting on named sites
- Binary has gone through many revisions
- Features of P2P network have evolved with time
- Hides on machine with rootkit technology

Enright 2007




The blue peers count is all peers being probed at a time. This includes live, active, dead, and unknown states. The peers line is not the size of the network. The active line is much closer to the instantaneous size of the network.

It can be seen in the month and year chart that Microsoft made a measurable dent in the network with the MRT Storm (Nuwar) release.


Geolocating bots enumerated for Naguche botnet Dittrich and Dietrich, "Discovery Techniques for P2P Botnets"

| Technique | Description | Pros | Cons |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Monitor endpoint | monitor traffic of a bot | simple, generally applica- <br> ble | limited view, encryption |
| Internet telescopes | monitor random-scan in- <br> fection attempts | botnet-wide view | limited applicability |
| Monitor IRC | record IRC C\&C traffic | simple, botnet-wide view | only IRC botnets |
| DNS redirect | hijack C\&C via DNS | measure infection size | limited applicability |
| Sybil monitoring | monitor numerous bots | simple, passive | resource-intensive, limited <br> view, structured P2P |
| Botnet crawling | crawl botnet overlay | enumerate large portion of <br> botnet | detectable |
| DNS cache probing | probe DNS caches for bot- <br> net C\&C | simple, passive | loose lower-bound |
| DNSBL <br> counter-intelligence | sniff DNSBL traffic, heuris- <br> tically identify bots | passive | limited applicability |
| Flow analysis | detect botnets via flow- <br> based anomaly detection | wide-scale, handles encryp- <br> tion | tailored to IRC botnets |

## Size estimates from literature as of 2008

| Study | Method(s) used | C\&C's <br> observed | Largest botnet size <br> infection |  | Total \# of <br> infected hosts |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $[13]$ | IRC monitoring | $\sim 100$ | 226,585 | - | - |
| $[8]$ | IRC monitoring | $\sim 180$ | $\sim 50,000$ | - | $\sim 300,000$ |
| $[22]$ | DNS cache probing | 65 | - | - | 85,000 |
|  | IRC monitoring | $>100$ | $>15,000$ | $\sim 3,000$ | - |
| $[23]$ | DNS cache probing | 100 | - | - | 88,000 |
|  | IRC monitoring | 472 | $\sim 100,000$ | $>10,000$ | 426,279 |
| $[5]$ | DNS redirection | $\sim 50$ | $>350,000$ | - | - |
| $[15]$ | flow analysis | $\sim 376$ | - | - | $\sim 6,000,000$ |
| $[7]$ | botnet crawling | 1 | $\sim 160,000$ | $\sim 44,000$ | - |

Figure 2: Size estimates from the literature. All sizes are the maximum ones given in the appropriate study and the final column represents the total number of infected hosts over all botnets encountered.

## Botnet takeover studies

- Spamalytics (Kanich et al., 2008)
- Storm botnet
- Rewrote spam to redirect to researcher-controlled websites
- Goal: click-through rate measurement
- Torpig C\&C sinkholing (Stone-gross et al., 2009)
- Torpig botnet
- Setup researcher controlled C\&C server (DNS fastflux)
- Goal: analysis of stolen data


Kanich et al., Spamalytics: An Empirical Analysis of Spam Marketing Conversion, 2008

## The victims



Kanich et al., Spamalytics: An Empirical Analysis of Spam Marketing Conversion, 2008

## Observed Conversion Rate

- 350 million email messages delivered
- 26 day campaign
- 28 "sales"
- 0.00001\%
- 27 of these male-enhancement products
- Statistical significance?


## Botnet takeover studies

- Spamalytics (Kanich et al., 2008)
- Storm botnet
- Rewrote spam to redirect to researcher-controlled websites
- Goal: click-through rate measurement
- Torpig C\&C sinkholing (Stone-gross et al., 2009)
- Torpig botnet
- Setup researcher controlled C\&C server (DNS fastflux)
- Goal: analysis of stolen data



## Figure 2: A man-in-the-browser phishing attack.

Stone-Gross et al., Your Botnet is My Botnet: Analysis of a Botnet Takeover, 2009


Stone-Gross et al., Your Botnet is My Botnet: Analysis of a Botnet Takeover, 2009


Figure 3. Unique bot IDs and IP addresses per hour. The number of unique IP addresses per hour provides a good estimation of Torpig's live population.

Stone-Gross et al., Your Botnet is My Botnet: Analysis of a Botnet Takeover, 2009

## Table 1. Data items sent to our C\&C server by Torpig bots.

| Data type | Data items |
| :--- | :--- |
| Form data | $11,966,532$ |
| Email | $1,258,862$ |
| Windows password | $1,235,122$ |
| POP account | 415,206 |
| HTTP account | 411,039 |
| SMTP account | 100,472 |
| Mailbox account | 54,090 |
| FTP account | 12,307 |

Stone-Gross et al., Your Botnet is My Botnet: Analysis of a Botnet Takeover, 2009

| Country | Institutions <br> $(\#)$ | Accounts <br> $(\#)$ |
| :--- | ---: | ---: |
| US | 60 | 4,287 |
| IT | 34 | 1,459 |
| DE | 122 | 641 |
| ES | 18 | 228 |
| PL | 14 | 102 |
| Other | 162 | 1,593 |
| Total | 410 | 8,310 |

Table 3: Accounts at financial institutions stolen by Torpig.

Stone-Gross et al., Your Botnet is My Botnet: Analysis of a Botnet Takeover, 2009

```
Original Message
Subject: Email Alert From UW-Madison Computer Sciences
Date: Wed, 5 Dec 2012 12:49:27 -0430 (VET)
From: cs.wisc.edu <asantanap@cantv.net>
To: <tannenba@cs.wisc.edu>, sswright@cs.wisc.eduz, <swift@cs.wisc.edu>,
<sweep@cs.wisc.edu>, \leqsumit@cs.wisc.edu>, ssuman@cs.wisc.edu>, \leqsuhui@cs.wisc.edu>,
<subbarao@cs.wisc.edu>, ssuan@cs.wisc.edu>, sstuart@cs.wisc.edu>, sstrik@cs.wisc.edu>,
<street@cs.wisc.edu>, \leqstever@cs.wisc.edu>, \leqstefanic@cs.wisc.edu>, \leqsrour@cs.wisc.edu>,
<sriram@cs.wisc.edu>, ssrikris@cs.wisc.edu>, <sray@cs.wisc.edu>, ssoni@cs.wisc.edu>,
<solomon@cs.wisc.edu>, <sohi@cs.wisc.edu>, ssoc-culture-greek-request@cs.wisc.edu>,
<smurphy@cs.wisc.edu>, <smoler@cs.wisc.edu>, <skrentny@cs.wisc.edu>, ssklein@cs.wisc.edu>,
<sjha@cs.wisc.edu>, <sigarch-members@cs.wisc.edu>, <shukla@cs.wisc.edu>,
<shuchi@cs.wisc.edu>, <shoup@cs.wisc.edu>, <shiliang@cs.wisc.edu>, <shavlikg@cs.wisc.edu>,
<shavlik@cs.wisc.edu>, <shaohua@cs.wisc.edu>, sshai@cs.wisc.edu>, <sghosh@cs.wisc.edu>,
<sqates@cs.wisc.edu>, ssensei.cs.wisc.edu@cs.wisc.edu>, ssekar@cs.wisc.edu>,
<seitz@cs.wisc.eduz, <sdsen@cs.wisc.edu>, <scout@cs.wisc.edu>, \leqscottk@cs.wisc.edu>,
<scg@cs.wisc.edu>, <saurabha@cs.wisc.edu>, <sastry@cs.wisc.eduz, <sashwin@cs.wisc.edu>,
<sandrist@cs.wisc.edu>, <sahakian@cs.wisc.edu>
Attention: Cs.wisc.edu Web User,
You have exceeded your e-mail account limit quota of 250 MB and you are requested to expand it within 48 hours or else your e-mail account will be disable from our database. Simply CLICK HERE <https://docs.google.com/spreadsheet
\(\angle\) viewform?formkey=dERrcTlFQ2tFZ3hETkkzcVc1UjMxWmc6MO \(>\) with the complete information requested to expand your e-mail account quota to 450MB.
Thank you for using indonet e-mail services. Copyright 02012 cs.wisc.edu Information Center.
```


## Botnets

- Botnets:
- Command and Control (C\&C)
- Zombie hosts (bots)
- C\&C type:
- centralized, peer-to-peer
- Infection vector:
- spam, random/targeted scanning
- Usage:
- What they do: spam, DDoS, SEO, traffic generation,


## Botnet countermeasures?

- Infection prevention
- Infection detection
- C\&C take-down
- Undermine the economics
- Banking take-down


## Infection detection \& remediation

## Anti-Botnet Efforts Still Nascent, But Groups Hopeful

Seven months after a government-industry coalition announced recommendations for ISPs to fight botnets, success is still a long way off

Nov 30, 2012 | 10:06 PM | 0 Comments
By Robert Lemos, Contributing Writer Dark Reading

## C\&C takedowns

## Microsoft Seizes ZeuS Servers in Anti-Botnet Rampage

BY KIM ZETTER 03.26.12 2:45 PM

It's not the first time Microsoft has attempted to take down botnets. The company previously attacked three other botnets - Waledac, Rustock and Kelihos - through similar civil suits that allowed the company to seize web addresses and associated computers. The gains from such takedowns, however, are generally shortlived. After Waledac was targeted, the criminals behind it simply altered their software to thwart easy detection and launched a new botnet.
http://www.wired.com/threatlevel/2012/03/ microsoft-botnet-takedown/

## Botnet countermeasures?

- Infection prevention
- Infection detection
- C\&C take-down
- Undermine the economics
- Banking take-down


## Studying grey/black market products

- Active measurement studies to:
- Understand (probably illicit) services on web
- Find ways to defuse underground markets
- Previous studies looked at botnets themselves and victims
- Let's look at the "backend"


## Traffic sellers

- Click fraud
- Click traffic sellers
- grey-market
- Class project pilot study to see what these sellers are all about
- Botnet traffic?
- Legitimate project?
- http://cseweb.ucsd.edu/~tristenp/buytraffic/

You can't make Sales if don't have VISIT ORS


Stop getting scammed from traffic sellers!
This is real quality traffic that We use for own sites.

INCREASE WEB TRAFFIC GUARANTEED!


## Click traffic sellers

| Web site | CP10k | Claimed traffic source |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| www.trafficdeliver.com | $\sim \$ 34.69$ | "Advertiser exchange" |
| revisitors.com | $\sim \$ 48.95$ | Recently expired <br> domain redirection? |
| qualitytrafficsupply.com | $\sim \$ 55.00$ | Contextual advertisements |
| mediatraffic.com | $\sim \$ 70$ | AdWare (Voomba) pop-ups |

Targeted vs. untargeted: specify geographic preferences
Affiliate networks paid to send traffic
Traffic resellers: resell purchased traffic

## Experimental methodology

(1) Setup several web sites (xxx.sysnet.ucsd.edu)

2 pages: index.html is landing site lucky.html linked to by index.html

Example site linked from webpage
(2) Attempt to purchase web traffic

Used temporary VISA number, but real name, etc.
(3) Sit back and let the research data come to us ...


## Adventures in purchasing web traffic...

Giving people money not as easy as I expected:
RE: Refund - [2423-DLXC-4301] [82a2e44b]

| 2Checkout Help Desk | ========= Please enter your reply ABOVE above this line ========= Hello Tom, ... | Dec 6 (5 days ago) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2Checkout Help Desk | A staff member has replied to your question: Seasons Greetings Tom, Thank you... | Dec 6 (5 days ago) |
| 2Checkout Help Desk | Thank you for adding a message to your question. We will respond to your mess... | Dec 6 (4 days ago) |
| 2Checkout Help Desk | to me show details Dec 6 (4 dys | s ago) ¢ Reply \\| |

$========$ Please enter your reply ABOVE above this line $========$
Hello Tom,
A staff member has replied to your question:
Dear Tom,
Thank you for contacting 2Checkout.com. I apologize for the delay in responding to your inquiry. The order was actually canceled trafficdeliver. com. They believe the order to be fraudulent. I have forwarded your inquiry to trafficdeliver.com. They will be contacting you via $e$-mail shortly. If you do not receive a response in a timely manner, please feel free to reopen this ticket for additional assistance.

Looking to make your holidays happier? 2Checkout makes it easy! Simply visit your favorite search engine and type in 2Checkout + and the type of merchandise you are looking for. It's the easy way to enjoy a fast, safe shopping experience online.

Thank You,
Josh Karamian
Customer Care
2Checkout.com
http://mww.2Checkout.com

## When did traffic arrive?



## When did traffic arrive?



- Not a typical pattern for traffic


## When did traffic arrive?



- Traffic has really high-degree of temporal proximity
- Anecdote: many IPs visit times clustered within seconds


## Is the traffic from bots or other malware?

| Source | Num IPs | Percentage |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| CBL | 21 | $1.7 \%$ |
| Current Storm | 0 | $0.0 \%$ |

## Other interesting anecdotal evidence

4 HEAD requests from distinct IPs with referrer
http://www.routetraffic.net/delivery/statistics/ 8x0ada67md29fk799sa4.html

(b) CDF of \# of mouse moves per visit across all visits

Zhang et al., Got Traffic? An Evaluation of Click Traffic Providers, 2011

## Spam-advertised products

- Pharmaceuticals
- Software
- Watches
- etc.

- What is order volume?
http://www.rioricopharmacy.com/
- What kinds of things are being purchased?
- What are weak links for disruption?

From Levchenko et al., "Click Trajectories: End-to-End Analysis of the Spam Value Chain", IEEE Symposium on Security and Privacy, 2011


## Measurement apparatus \#1



Kanich et al., Show Me the Money: Characterizing Spam-advertised Revenue, 2011


Kanich et al., Show Me the Money: Characterizing Spam-advertised Revenue, 2011

## Measurement Apparatus \#2



| Product | Quantity | Min order |
| :--- | ---: | ---: |
| Generic Viagra | 568 | $\$ 78.80$ |
| Cialis | 286 | $\$ 78.00$ |
| Cialis/Viagra Combo Pack | 172 | $\$ 74.95$ |
| Viagra Super Active+ | 121 | $\$ 134.80$ |
| Female (pink) Viagra | 119 | $\$ 44.00$ |
| Human Growth Hormone | 104 | $\$ 83.95$ |
| Soma (Carisoprodol) | 99 | $\$ 94.80$ |
| Viagra Professional | 87 | $\$ 139.80$ |
| Levitra | 83 | $\$ 100.80$ |
| Viagra Super Force | 81 | $\$ 88.80$ |
| Cialis Super Active+ | 72 | $\$ 172.80$ |
| Amoxicillin | 47 | $\$ 35.40$ |
| Lipitor | 38 | $\$ 14.40$ |
| Ultram | 38 | $\$ 45.60$ |
| Tramadol | 36 | $\$ 82.80$ |
| Prozac | 35 | $\$ 19.50$ |
| Cialis Professional | 33 | $\$ 176.00$ |
| Retin A | 31 | $\$ 47.85$ |

Kanich et al., Show Me the Money: Characterizing Spam-advertised Revenue, 2011


Levchenko et al., Click Trajectories: An End-to-End Analysis of the Spam Value Chain, 2011

- 120 items purchased
- 76 authorized
- 56 settled
- 49 products delivered
- 2 sent after mailbox lease ended
- 2 no follow-up email
- 2 resent after mailbox lease ended
- 1 promised refund (never obtained)

| Supplier | Item | Origin | Affiliate Programs |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Aracoma Drug | Orange bottle of tablets (pharma) | WV, USA | ClFr |
| Combitic Global Caplet Pvt. Ltd. | Blister-packed tablets (pharma) | Delhi, India | GlvMd |
| M.K. Choudhary | Blister-packed tablets (pharma) | Thane, India | OLPh |
| PPW | Blister-packed tablets (pharma) | Chennai, India | PhEx, Stmul, Trust, CIFr |
| K. Sekar | Blister-packed tablets (pharma) | Villupuram, India | WldPh |
| Rhine Inc. | Blister-packed tablets (pharma) | Thane, India | RxPrm, DrgRev |
| Supreme Suppliers | Blister-packed tablets (pharma) | Mumbai, India | Eva |
| Chen Hua | Small white plastic bottles (herbal) | Jiangmen, China | Stud |
| Etech Media Ltd | Novelty-sized supplement (herbal) | Christchurch, NZ | Staln |
| Herbal Health Fulfillment Warehouse | White plastic bottle (herbal) | MA, USA | Eva |
| MK Sales | White plastic bottle (herbal) | WA, USA | GlvMd |
| Riverton, Utah shipper | White plastic bottle (herbal) | UT, USA | DrMax, Grow |
| Guo Zhonglei | Foam-wrapped replica watch | Baoding, China | Dstn, UltRp |

Table VI: List of product suppliers and associated affiliate programs and/or store brands.

## Bank



Levchenko et al., Click Trajectories: An End-to-End Analysis of the Spam Value Chain, 2011

Can we throttle abuse by targeting merchant accounts at banks?

- McCoy et al., Priceless: The Role of Payments in Abuse-advertised Goods, 2012
- Made purchases to pharma and software OEM programs, while also working with brandholders to make complaints to Visa/MC


Figure 4: Example of a program receiving complaints to a card network. Rows denote distinct merchant descriptors; row "X" shows refused orders.

Wrote one eloquent affiliate in March of this year, "Right now most affiliate eprograms have a mass of declines, cancels and pendings, and it doesn't depend much on the program IMHO, there is a general sad picture, fucking Visa is burning us with napalm."

## Ethics

- We ha From paper on Torpig takeover (Stone-Gross et al.)
- mea PRINCIPLE 1. The sinkholed botnet should be operated so that any harm and/or damage to victims and targets of
- part attacks would be minimized.
- takir PRINCIPLE 2. The sinkholed botnet should collect enough in-
- purc formation to enable notification and remediation of affected par-ties.
- port scanning victims
- Ethics discussion in papers:
- short discussion justifying lack of harm
- "beyond the scope of this work"


## E -crime is a complex ecosystem

- Lots of moving parts
- Economics important
- Fascinating measurement studies
- Technical mechanisms often don't measure up
- "In Planning Digital Defenses, the Biggest Obstacle Is Human Ingenuity" -Stefan Savage
- http://www.nytimes.com/2011/12/06/science/ stefan-savage-girding-for-digital-threats-we-havent-imagined-yet.html?_r=1\&ref=science

